

# **Türkiye and Mexico:** Export concentration & Economic Complexity

March 2025

**Creating Opportunities** 





### 01 Export recomposition: Destination and product

#### 02 Value Added in exports and production linkages in GVC

#### 03 Economic complexity: Dynamics of top traded products

#### 04 Opportunities for Mexico & Türkiye



# Export's concentration and recomposition

The Herfindahl-Hirschman Index (HHI) shows that Mexico and Türkiye have diverged in their exports concentration paths over the past decade.



 $IHH_D = \left(\sum_{c} \left(\frac{x_{cp}}{X}\right)^2 - \frac{1}{D}\right) * \left(\frac{1}{1 - \frac{1}{2}}\right)$ 

### **Export concentration: Two Perspectives**

We estimate two normalized\* Herfindahl-Hirschman Indices (closer to 1 means higher concentration) for Mexico and Türkiye

 $IHH_D = 1$  The exporting country concentrates all of its exports in a single country

 $IHH_P = 0$  The country exports a uniformly weighted basket of goods (each with the same share)  $IHH_P = (\sum (\frac{x_{cp}}{X})^2 - \frac{1}{P}) * (\frac{1}{1-\frac{1}{P}})$ 

Example for IHH_D with 5 destination countries for a given year: Market Shares (%)								
	Scenario (A)	(B)	(C)	(D)	(E)	(F)		
Country 1	100%	90%	50%	60%	40%	20%		
Country 2		10%	50%	25%	25%	20%		
Country 3				15%	25%	20%		
Country 4					10%	20%		
Country 5						20%		
Traditional HHI	10,000	8,200	5,000	4,450	2,950	2,000		
Normalized HHI	1	0.64	0	0.34	0.18	0		

\*Cracau, Lima. (2016) "On the Normalized Herfindahl-Hirschman Index: A Technical Note"

Oil exports (crude and refined) are excluded from analysis related to data quality issues and following Hausmann, R., Hidalgo, C. A., Bustos, S., Coscia, M., Simoes, A., & Yıldırım, M. A. (2013).

### Notes on data cleansing and processing

We use international trade data from <u>Harvard Growth Lab Atlas Data</u> which recovers trade flows from the United

Nations Statistical Division (UN Comtrade) and follows the Bustos-Yildirim Method to generate consistent estimates of trade flows between countries. No services trade was considered for the study.

- The data set was updated in September 2024, comprising the period 1995 2022.
- We select the Harmonized System 1992 (HS) at 4-digit levels due to inconsistencies at the 6-digit level.
- We excluded "Undeclared" trading partners" (ANS code), Commodities not specified according to kind (9999 code), and Trade data discrepancies (XXX)
- We also exclude Petroleum oils, crude (2709 code), and refined products (2710 code) due to inconsistencies with national data sources for Mexico and Türkiye.

#### Diverging paths in the export concentration by destination country (IHH\_D)



EXPORT CONCENTRATION BY DESTINATION

(IHH D: 0-1)\*

#### **EXPORT CONCENTRATION BY DESTINATION** (CHANGE %, SELECTED PERIODS)

 5-01 vs 02-07

 2-07 vs 08-12

 8-12 vs 13-16

 3-16 vs 17-22

 2000-2010

 2011-2022

 -60.0%
 -40.0%

 -20.0%
 0.0%

 HHI\_D Mexico

 HHI\_D Türkiye

 HHI\_D Türkiye

Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse. \*Value close to 1 means a greater export concentration (less diversification).

The HHI\_D is clearly different for both countries. Mexico's exports are concentrated on the north-american region while Türkiye has steadily diversified the countries to export, up to 14.9% in the period 2011-2022 both by increasing the number of countries and reducing the concentration among the top trading partners, even when considering the EU as a single market.

#### In 2022, 94.4% of Mexico's exports went into the Top 10 destination countries

#### MEXICO: TOP 10 EXPORT PARTNERS (SORTED BY SHARE % OF TOTAL EXPORTS)



1995 (92%)	2000 (94.6%)	2005 (93.8%)	2010 (91%)	2015 (93.2%)	2022 (94.4%)
USA (82.5%)	USA (87.9%)	USA (85.3%)	USA (77.9%)	USA (83.3%)	USA (83.4%)
CAN (3.2%)	CAN (2.5%)	CAN (2.3%)	CAN (4.1%)	CAN (3.6%)	CAN (3.9%)
BRA (1.2%)	DEU (0.9%)	DEU (1.2%)	DEU (1.5%)	CHN (1.5%)	CHN (2.6%)
JPN (1.1%)	JPN (0.7%)	JPN (0.9%)	CHN (1.5%)	DEU (1%)	DEU (1.1%)
DEU (0.8%)	GBR (0.6%)	COL (0.9%)	COL (1.5%)	COL (0.9%)	JPN (0.7%)
CHL (0.7%)	BRA (0.4%)	CHN (0.8%)	BRA (1.3%)	BRA (0.8%)	BRA (0.6%)
COL (0.7%)	VEN (0.4%)	VEN (0.7%)	JPN (1.1%)	JPN (0.7%)	KOR (0.6%)
HKG (0.6%)	GTM (0.4%)	GBR (0.6%)	GBR (0.7%)	GTM (0.5%)	GBR (0.5%)
FRA (0.6%)	CHL (0.4%)	BRA (0.5%)	ARG (0.7%)	KOR (0.5%)	COL (0.5%)
GBR (0.6%)	COL (0.3%)	GTM (0.5%)	CHL (0.7%)	FRA (0.4%)	GTM (0.4%)

#### TÜRKIYE: TOP 10 EXPORT PARTNERS (SORTED BY SHARE % OF TOTAL EXPORTS)



1995 (63.5%)	2000 (65.4%)	2005 (58.7%)	2010 (50.2%)	2015 (50%)	2022 (48.7%)
DEU (24%)	DEU (19.1%)	DEU (13.2%)	DEU (10.5%)	DEU (9.3%)	DEU (8.9%)
USA (7.8%)	USA (11.9%)	GBR (8.7%)	ITA (6.3%)	GBR (7.8%)	USA (6.9%)
RUS (6.1%)	GBR (8.3%)	ITA (7.6%)	GBR (6.1%)	IRQ (6.7%)	IRQ (5.9%)
ITA (5.7%)	FRA (6.6%)	USA (6.1%)	IRQ (5.7%)	ITA (5%)	GBR (5.3%)
GBR (5.3%)	ITA (6.3%)	FRA (5.5%)	FRA (5.6%)	USA (4.7%)	ITA (5.2%)
FRA (5%)	NLD (3%)	ESP (4.4%)	RUS (4.2%)	FRA (4.2%)	FRA (4%)
NLD (3.6%)	ESP (2.7%)	IRQ (4.1%)	USA (3.2%)	CHE (3.6%)	RUS (3.9%)
SAU (2.3%)	ISR (2.6%)	RUS (3.4%)	ESP (3.1%)	ARE (3%)	ESP (3.4%)
BEL (1.9%)	BEL (2.4%)	NLD (3.1%)	ARE (2.7%)	IRN (2.9%)	ISR (2.9%)
ESP (1.7%)	RUS (2.4%)	ROU (2.6%)	IRN (2.7%)	ESP (2.9%)	NLD (2.3%)

Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse.

Mexico's export destination composition has remained stable over the last 20 years. In the same period, Türkiye has reduced its dependence on the German market while increasing its share in the US, UK, Iraq, and other European countries. In 2022, Türkiye's top 10 export partners accounted for 48.7% of total exports, Mexico's top 10 account for 94.4%

ک

### China's share in Mexico's exports increased 18% between 2017-2022

#### MEXICO'S EXPORT DESTINATION

(GAIN IN SHARE % OF TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022)



Partner name	Share 2017	Share 2022	Change % 22-17
United Kingdom	0.32%	0.53%	67.41
Belgium	0.29%	0.38%	31.27
China	2.22%	2.62%	18.02
El Salvador	0.15%	0.17%	15.52
South Korea	0.53%	0.59%	11.90
Switzerland	0.19%	0.21%	9.37
Guatemala	0.40%	0.44%	7.91
Turkiye	0.16%	0.17%	7.58
Thailand	0.11%	0.12%	6.96
Czechia	0.12%	0.13%	6.05
Spain	0.30%	0.31%	4.95
Canada	3.79%	3.92%	3.31
United States of America	81.06%	83.41%	2.90

#### MEXICO'S EXPORT DESTINATION (LOSS IN SHARE % OF TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022)

Partner name	Share 2017	Share 2022	Change % 22-17
United Arab Emirates	0.12%	0.12%	-3.42
Australia	0.36%	0.35%	-4.46
Honduras	0.14%	0.12%	-9.53
Nicaragua	0.18%	0.16%	-11.90
Italy	0.15%	0.13%	-12.33
Brazil	0.80%	0.65%	-18.86
Dominican Republic	0.13%	0.11%	-19.04
Panama	0.19%	0.15%	-24.67
Japan	0.93%	0.70%	-25.44
Colombia	0.64%	0.47%	-26.29
Costa Rica	0.21%	0.15%	-27.90
Hong Kong	0.16%	0.11%	-29.38
Netherlands	0.33%	0.22%	-33.45
Peru	0.31%	0.20%	-34.76
Chile	0.40%	0.24%	-39.81
Germany	1.82%	1.07%	-41.41
India	0.27%	0.14%	-47.55
Argentina	0.35%	0.17%	-50.99
France	0.49%	0.17%	-65.98

Note: Filtered for countries with a share larger than 0.1% of total exports. Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse.

### Russia's share in Türkiye's exports doubled between 2017-2022

#### TÜRKIYE'S EXPORT DESTINATION (GAIN IN SHARE % OF TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022)



Partner name	Share 2017	Share 2022	Change % 22-17
Russia	1.86%	3.89%	109.18
Libya	0.59%	1.21%	104.18
Serbia	0.66%	1.03%	54.67
Israel	2.07%	2.89%	39.55
United States of America	4.95%	6.88%	38.92
Egypt	1.31%	1.76%	34.57
Ukraine	0.82%	1.08%	31.72
Greece	0.92%	1.20%	30.98
Bulgaria	1.58%	1.97%	24.54
Kazakhstan	0.54%	0.67%	24.28
Morocco	1.09%	1.30%	19.28
Czechia	0.79%	0.93%	16.91
Canada	0.72%	0.83%	15.38
Poland	1.86%	2.13%	14.27
Georgia	0.88%	0.99%	12.53
Azerbaijan	0.93%	1.04%	12.15
Italy	4.84%	5.22%	7.83
Lebanon	0.59%	0.63%	7.00
Netherlands	2.15%	2.30%	6.69
Qatar	0.51%	0.54%	6.27

#### TÜRKIYE'S EXPORT DESTINATION (LOSS IN SHARE % OF TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022)



Partner name	Share 2017	Share 2022	Change % 22-17
Slovenia	0.56%	0.56%	-0.09
Tunisia	0.61%	0.60%	-0.88
Hungary	0.69%	0.66%	-3.44
Switzerland	0.63%	0.59%	-6.07
Germany	9.71%	8.85%	-8.84
Iraq	6.54%	5.93%	-9.36
France	4.45%	4.03%	-9.53
Denmark	0.67%	0.60%	-9.98
Austria	0.91%	0.80%	-12.06
Syria	1.02%	0.88%	-13.66
United Kingdom	6.54%	5.30%	-19.02
Sweden	0.84%	0.66%	-21.20
Spain	4.38%	3.44%	-21.57
Algeria	1.19%	0.88%	-25.81
Belgium	2.04%	1.51%	-26.22
China	1.84%	1.33%	-27.66
Iran	2.46%	1.26%	-48.80
United Arab Emirates	5.38%	2.17%	-59.63

Note: Filtered for countries with a share larger than 0.5% of total exports. Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse.

### Since 2017, Russia and China have increased their share of exports

#### MEXICO'S EXPORT DESTINATION (GAIN IN SHARE % OF TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022)

-65 98



#### **TÜRKIYE'S EXPORT DESTINATION** (GAIN IN SHARE % OF TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022)



109 18

-59 634

### Diverging paths post 2016 in the export concentration by product (IHH\_P)

EXPORT CONCENTRATION BY PRODUCT

(CHANGE %, SELECTED PERIODS)

#### EXPORT CONCENTRATION BY PRODUCT (IHH\_P: 0-1)\*



Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse. \*Value close to 1 means a greater export concentration (less diversification).

The HHI\_P index shows stable trend before 2008 when Mexico started to concentrate even further meanwhile Türkiye began a recomposition of its export portfolio. Over the period 2011-2022 Türkiye has diversified the exported products by 26.7%, in contrast Mexico has concentrated 20.5%

#### Top 10 most exported products by Mexico account for 45.8% of total exports

#### MEXICO: TOP 10 TRADED PRODUCTS (SORTED BY SHARE % TOTAL EXPORTS)



1995 (35.4%)	2000 (40.6%)	2005 (39.4%)	2010 (45.3%)	2015 (46.8%)	2022 (45.8%)
(10.4%) Cars	(10.8%) Cars	(7.3%) Cars	(9.1%) Cars	(9.4%) Cars	(9.2%) Cars
(4.7%) Insulated electrical wire	(5.4%) Computers	(5.6%) Monitors and projectors	(7.8%) Monitors and projectors	(7.2%) Parts of motor vehicles	(8.3%) Computers
(4.1%) Monitors and projectors	(4.4%) Insulated electrical wire	(5.3%) Parts of motor vehicles	(5.3%) Parts of motor vehicles	(6.2%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods	(7.9%) Parts of motor vehicles
(3.2%) Spark-ignition reciprocating internal combustion piston engines	(3.8%) Parts of motor vehicles	(5%) Computers	(5.3%) Computers	(5.4%) Computers	(6.6%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods
(3.1%) Parts of motor vehicles	(3.8%) Monitors and projectors	(4%) Insulated electrical wire	(4.1%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods	(4.7%) Monitors and projectors	(3.4%) Insulated electrical wire
(2.6%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods	(3.1%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods	(3.9%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods	(3.9%) Transmission apparatus for radio, telephone and TV	(4.1%) Telephones	(2.8%) Monitors and projectors
(2.4%) Computers	(2.4%) Transmission apparatus for radio, telephone and TV	(2.9%) Transmission apparatus for radio, telephone and TV	(3.3%) Telephones	(3.3%) Insulated electrical wire	(2.6%) Medical instruments
(1.8%) Parts of radios, telephones, and T.V.s	(2.4%) Telephones	(2%) Seats	(2.6%) Insulated electrical wire	(2.6%) Tractors	(2.2%) Transmission apparatus for radio, telephone and TV
(1.7%) Reception apparatus for radio broadcasting	(2.3%) Electrical apparatus for < 1k volts	(1.7%) Electrical apparatus for < 1k volts	(2.2%) Gold	(2.1%) Medical instruments	(1.4%) Refrigerators, freezers
(1.5%) Electrical apparatus for < 1k volts	(2.1%) Parts and accessories for office machines	(1.7%) Medical instruments	(1.9%) Medical instruments	(1.8%) Seats	(1.4%) Electrical boards

#### TÜRKIYE: TOP 10 TRADED PRODUCTS (SORTED BY SHARE % TOTAL EXPORTS)



1995 (26.2%)	2000 (26.5%)	2005 (30.4%)	2010 (24.7%)	2015 (26.9%)	2022 (20.3%)
(3.8%) Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit	(4.5%) T-shirts, knit	(6%) Cars	(5.5%) Cars	(5.7%) Gold	(3.8%) Cars
(3.6%) Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	(3.7%) Women's suits and pants	(4%) Monitors and projectors	(3.1%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods	(4.7%) Cars	(3.5%) Jewelry of precious metal
(3.2%) T-shirts, knit	(3.1%) Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit	(3.8%) T-shirts, knit	(3%) Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	(2.9%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods	(2.7%) Parts of motor vehicles
(3.1%) Women's suits and pants	(2.9%) Monitors and projectors	(3.4%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods	(2.4%) T-shirts, knit	(2.8%) Parts of motor vehicles	(2.3%) Motor vehicles for transporting goods
(2.7%) Other nuts	(2.4%) Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	(3.2%) Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	(2.4%) Parts of motor vehicles	(2.4%) Jewelry of precious metal	(1.7%) Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged
(2.6%) Women's suits, knit	(2.3%) Cars	(3%) Women's suits and pants	(1.8%) Semifinished products of iron or nonalloy steel	(2%) Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	(1.5%) Women's suits and pants
(2.1%) Semifinished products of iron or nonalloy steel	(2.1%) Men's suits and pants	(2%) Parts of motor vehicles	(1.7%) Insulated electrical wire	(2%) T-shirts, knit	(1.5%) Insulated electrical wire
(1.8%) Leather apparel	(1.9%) House linen	(1.7%) Men's suits and pants	(1.6%) Women's suits and pants	(1.6%) Insulated electrical wire	(1.1%) T-shirts, knit
(1.7%) Women's undergarments, knit	(1.9%) Other aircraft and spacecraft	(1.7%) Other nuts	(1.6%) Gold	(1.5%) Women's suits and pants	(1.1%) Refrigerators, freezers
(1.6%) Men's suits and pants	(1.6%) Parts of motor vehicles	(1.7%) Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit	(1.5%) Monitors and projectors	(1.4%) Other nuts	(1.1%) Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit

٩

### **Electronics and Machinery increase their share in Mexico's exports**

HS4

8409

8543

8481

8501

804

8407

8703

8528

9032

8411

#### **MEXICO'S EXPORT BY PRODUCT**

(GAIN IN SHARE % TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022 HS4)



HS4	Product	Share 2017	Share 2022	Change % 22-17
8542	Electronic integrated circuits	0.64%	0.91%	41.43
8415	Air conditioners	0.91%	1.27%	39.37
8471	Computers	6.11%	8.30%	35.82
8504	Electrical transformers	0.73%	0.97%	33.89
7108	Gold	0.68%	0.90%	33.45
2603	Copper ore	0.57%	0.72%	27.71
8421	Centrifuges	0.65%	0.83%	27.55
8512	Electrical lighting eq. for motor vehicles	0.67%	0.83%	22.70
2203	Beer	0.98%	1.19%	21.64
8537	Electrical boards	1.14%	1.38%	21.29
3923	Packing lids	0.52%	0.62%	18.67
9018	Medical instruments	2.19%	2.57%	17.07
8418	Refrigerators, freezers	1.26%	1.44%	14.75
8536	Electrical apparatus for < 1k volts	0.91%	1.04%	13.68
8414	Pumps, compressors, fans, etc.	0.68%	0.77%	13.14
8708	Parts of motor vehicles	7.03%	7.94%	12.98
8544	Insulated electrical wire	3.17%	3.44%	8.53
702	Tomatoes	0.52%	0.56%	7.65
3926	Other articles of plastic	0.53%	0.57%	7.57
8413	Pumps for liquids	0.53%	0.55%	4.68
709	Other vegetables	0.63%	0.64%	1.34
8704	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	6.55%	6.56%	0.06

#### MEXICO'S EXPORT BY PRODUCT

(GAIN IN SHARE % TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022 HS4)

	Product	Share 2017	Share 2022	Change % 22-17
	Parts suitable for use with spark-ignition engines	1.08%	1.08%	-0.12
	Electrical machines with individual functions n.e.c.	0.55%	0.54%	-0.62
	Appliances for thermostatically controlled valves	0.66%	0.64%	-2.91
	Electric motors and generators	0.98%	0.95%	-3.62
	Avocados, pineapples, mangos, etc.	0.84%	0.79%	-5.10
	Spark-ignition reciprocating int. combustion engines	0.91%	0.78%	-14.05
		40 700/	0.000/	14.00
	Cars	10.73%	9.20%	-14.30
	Manitara and projectors	3 / 10/	2 70%	18.05
	Monitors and projectors	3.41%	2.1970	-18.05
	Automatic regulating instruments	0.65%	0.50%	-22.85
_		0.0070	0.0070	22.00
	Gas turbines	0.76%	0.56%	-26.52

Note: Filtered for countries with a share larger than 0.5% of total exports. Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse.

### Iron/Steel products and metals (jewelry) gain share in Türkiye's exports

#### **TÜRKIYE'S EXPORT BY PRODUCT**

(GAIN IN SHARE % TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022 HS4)



HS4	Product	Share 2017	Share 2022	Change % 22-17
7308	Structures and their parts, of iron or steel	0.65%	1.02%	56.83
7113	Jewelry of precious metal	2.60%	3.47%	33.33
9401	Seats	0.53%	0.68%	27.95
3920	Other plates of plastics, noncellular and not reinforced	0.70%	0.86%	21.76
9403	Other furniture and parts	0.85%	1.03%	20.91
7214	Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	1.56%	1.72%	10.21
4011	New pneumatic tires of rubber	0.70%	0.76%	8.31
7306	Other tubes, pipes and hollow profiles of iron or steel	0.74%	0.79%	6.56
8544	Insulated electrical wire	1.43%	1.51%	5.33
6802	Worked building stone	0.56%	0.58%	4.58
3923	Packing lids	0.55%	0.57%	4.44

#### TÜRKIYE'S EXPORT BY PRODUCT (GAIN IN SHARE % TOTAL EXPORTS, 2017-2022 HS4)



HS4	Product	Share 2017	Share 2022	Change % 22-17
8708	Parts of motor vehicles	2.76%	2.71%	-1.93
6110	Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit	1.12%	1.08%	-2.94
8516	Electric heaters	0.65%	0.62%	-4.64
1101	Wheat or meslin flour	0.67%	0.63%	-5.97
8418	Refrigerators, freezers	1.15%	1.08%	-6.21
6204	Women's suits and pants	1.64%	1.52%	-7.04
6002	Other knitted fabrics	0.92%	0.83%	-10.10
7208	Flat-rolled iron, width > 600mm, hot-rolled, not clad	0.86%	0.74%	-13.70
5702	Woven carpets and rugs	1.12%	0.96%	-14.42
6203	Men's suits and pants	0.99%	0.83%	-15.96
6115	Socks, stockings, etc., knit	0.65%	0.55%	-16.00
6104	Women's suits, knit	0.73%	0.58%	-21.11
6302	House linen	0.74%	0.57%	-23.30
8704	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	2.99%	2.27%	-24.16
802	Other nuts	0.89%	0.66%	-26.34
8409	Parts suitable for use with spark-ignition engines	1.12%	0.74%	-33.97
6109	T-shirts, knit	1.79%	1.12%	-37.35
8702	Buses	1.05%	0.63%	-39.92
8703	Cars	7.26%	3.84%	-47.15
7108	Gold	4.35%	0.53%	-87.73

Note: Filtered for countries with a share larger than 0.5% of total exports. Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse.



02

# Value Added in exports and GVC linkages

China increased its share of value added in Mexico and Türkiye's exports by c. 20% between 2017 and 2020

**Creating Opportunities** 

### Notes on data cleansing and processing

We use <u>the OECD's Inter-Country Input Output (ICIO)</u> which records the domestic and foreign intersectoral relations of 68 countries and 45 sectors consistent with national GDP and global production linkages (better suited than Harvard Atla's for the estimated GVC metrics).

- The data set was updated in June 2024 comprising the period 1995 2020. The ICIO is available within the <u>icio</u> package by Borin and Mancini (2019) for Stata and in <u>exvatools</u> by Feás (2024) in R; we used the latter for the estimation of foreign/Domestic VA in exports and production (forward and backward) linkages.
- We rely on Borin and Mancini's (2019) methodology, which follows the perspective of the exporting country (Mexico/Türkiye), to disaggregate export flows consistent with a country's GDP as follows:

Let the aggregate exports of a country be defined as:

 $E_{s} = V_{s}B_{ss}E_{s} + \sum_{t \neq s}^{G} V_{t}B_{ts}E_{s}$ 

Where  $E_s$  is the value of the exports of country s,  $V_s$  is the technical coefficient matrix of country s and  $B_{ss}$  is the inverse Leontief matrix quadrant for the domestic country s and  $B_{st}$  is the inverse Leontief matrix quadrant for the domestic country s and  $B_{st}$  is the inverse Leontief matrix quadrant for the domestic country s and  $C_{st}$  is the inverse Leontief matrix quadrant for the domestic country s and  $B_{st}$  is the inverse Leontief matrix quadrant for the domestic country s and country t. Under these definitions<sup>17</sup>, the first summand  $V_s B_{ss} E_{s^*}$  is the domestic VA content and the second one  $\sum_{t \neq s}^{G} V_t B_{ts} E_{s^*}$  is the foreign VA content.

۹

### For every \$100 Mexico export, how much added value (VA) is Mexican?

#### VALUE ADDED IN EXPORTS, MEXICO

(% OF TOTAL EXPORTS)



Source: BBVA Research with data from OECD. Methodology based on Koopman, Wang & Wei (2014) and Borin and Mancini (2019).

The share of domestic value added (VA) in Mexican exports began to decrease after the sign of NAFTA in 1994, the following 25 years remained relatively constant averaging 63.8% since 2000. The US share of VA in mexican exports has steadily decrease since 2017 while China's has increased 124 bps.

VALUE ADDED IN EXPORTS, MEXICO (BPS CHANGE 2017 - 2020)

### China's Value Added accounted for 2.4% of Türkiye total exports in 2020

VALUE ADDED IN EXPORTS, TÜRKIYE

(BPS CHANGE 2017 - 2020)

#### VALUE ADDED IN EXPORTS, TÜRKIYE (% OF TOTAL EXPORTS)

100 Domestic VA -92.7 (Türkiye) China 41.3 90 10.9 Germany 88.4 Adjusted axis at 70% 86.8 85.7 Russia 80 81.5 USA 12.0 78.9 78.5 78.5 78.2 76.476.1 76.6 75.4 -2.0 Italy 70 2004 2005 2007 2008 366 2006 2009 996 998 666 2000 2001 2002 2003 2013 2014 201 201 201 01 202 201 201 201 Other Ò Countries Other Countries USA Russia Germanv Italy -100 -50 50 100 Domestic VA (Türkiye) China

Source: BBVA Research with data from OECD. Methodology based on Koopman, Wang & Wei (2014) and Borin and Mancini (2019).

The domestic value added within Türkiye's exports has decreased steadily since 1995 but remains over 76.1% by 2020. During this period, Germany and Russia had the most significant gains in VA, with China seeing the most significant growth of 41.3 bps from 2017 to 2020.

#### Türkiye's backward linkages in global value chains have grown significantly

### **PRODUCTION LINKAGES: FORWARD AND BACKWARD** (% OF TOTAL EXPORTS)



- Forward linkage (FL) measures the domestic value that, once exported, is used as intermediate inputs and exported to a third country. Backward linkage (BL) allows us to measure the value of foreign intermediate goods in exports.
- Literature indicates that a country's participation in GVC increases productivity, boosting employment and regional economies through demand for local inputs (World Bank, 2022). However, the literature suggests that the benefits of productive linkages are not symmetrical, with FL having a more significant positive impact than BL.

### Türkiye portrays a more balanced position in terms of GVC linkages

#### BACKWARD LINKAGE, SELECTED COUNTRIES 2020 (% OF TOTAL EXPORTS)



**FORWARD LINKAGE, SELECTED COUNTRIES 2020** (% OF TOTAL EXPORTS)



Source: BBVA Research with data from OECD. Methodology based on Koopman, Wang & Wei (2014) and Borin and Mancini (2019).

In the case of Mexico, backward linkage (BL) exceeds forward linkage more than four times; that is, the proportion of foreign VA in Mexico's exports considerably exceeds the proportion of Mexican added value incorporated into the exports of other countries. Mexico's FL is among the lowest in the OECD while Türkiye ranks closer to India, China and Brazil.



03

# Economic Complexity Dynamics

Mexico's economic complexity has stagnated over the last years, while Türkiye has steadily increased the complexity of the top exported products.



### Notes on data cleansing and processing

We used the <u>ecomplexity</u> package for Python to estimate Economic Complexity (ECI) and Product Complexity (PCI).

Stata implementation is also available here.

- We use international trade data from <u>Harvard Growth Lab Atlas Data</u> (See Section 1 for a more detailed description).
- Services trade were excluded from the study.

To create the **Product Space**, following Hidalgo, C. A., Klinger, B., Barabasi, A.-L., & Hausmann, R. (2007) we took the <u>product coordinates embeddings of a proximity matrix</u>. Distances between products represent their relatedness based on whether products are co-exported by countries; the resulting coordinates also allow us to position

higher-complexity product clusters further away from less complex ones.

- The <u>NetworkX</u> Python package allowed us to illustrate the product space with 8 clusters and 865 products at the HS4 level.
- This visualization was not currently available on the official Harvard Atlas website by the date this report was published.

### High complexity countries have broader sophisticated capabilities

### COUNTRY ECONOMIC COMPLEXITY RANKING (RANK)



COUNTRY ECONOMIC COMPLEXITY (INDEX, 2022)



Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse. The Atlas of Economic Complexity offers information for 133 countries after filtering through data quality, trade > \$1 Billion USD and population > 1 million.

Mexico ranks 21st out of 133 countries as of 2022 and has maintained its position in the top 20 for the past few years, having been surpassed by China in 2018. Meanwhile, Türkiye has improved its ranking, surpassing both Brazil and India. The two countries are at different stages of development concerning economic complexity.

### From 2000 to 2010 both countries increased their economic complexity

#### NORMALIZED ECONOMIC COMPLEXITY INDEX (ECI\_NORM)\*



Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse.

Since 2011, Mexico's complexity has stagnated, while Türkiye has increased its economic complexity by 28.1% until 2022. This growth has narrowed the gap between the two countries despite a slight decline in complexity from 2013 to 2016. However, this drop was more than compensated for by a 28% increase in complexity between 2017 and 2022.

NORMALIZED ECONOMIC COMPLEXITY INDEX (CHANGE %, SELECTED PERIODS)

### Türkiye's top traded products complexity has increased steadily

#### MEXICO: TOP 10 TRADED PRODUCTS (PRODUCT COMPLEXITY INDEX & ECI)



1995	2000	2005	2010	2015	2022
Cars	Cars	Cars	Cars	Cars	Cars
Insulated electrical wire	Computers	Monitors and projectors	Monitors and projectors	Parts of motor vehicles	Computers
Monitors and projectors	Insulated electrical wire	Parts of motor vehicles	Parts of motor vehicles	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	Parts of motor vehicles
Spark-ignition reciprocating internal combustion piston engines	Parts of motor vehicles	Computers	Computers	Computers	Motor vehicles for transporting goods
Parts of motor vehicles	Monitors and projectors	Insulated electrical wire	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	Monitors and projectors	Insulated electrical wire
Motor vehicles for transporting goods	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	Transmission apparatus for radio, telephone and TV	Telephones	Monitors and projectors
Computers	Transmission apparatus for radio, telephone and TV	Transmission apparatus for radio, telephone and TV	Telephones	Insulated electrical wire	Medical instruments
Parts of radios, telephones, and T.V.s	Telephones	Seats	Insulated electrical wire	Tractors	Transmission apparatus for radio, telephone and TV
Reception apparatus for radio broadcasting	Electrical apparatus for < 1k volts	Electrical apparatus for < 1k volts	Gold	Medical instruments	Refrigerators, freezers
Electrical apparatus for < 1k volts	Parts and accessories for office machines	Medical instruments	Medical instruments	Seats	Electrical boards
0.86	1.06	1.32	1.57	1.47	1.24

#### TÜRKIYE: TOP 10 TRADED PRODUCTS (PRODUCT COMPLEXITY INDEX & ECI)

1995	2000	2005	2010	2015	2022
Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit	T-shirts, knit	Cars	Cars	Gold	Cars
Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	Women's suits and pants	Monitors and projectors	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	Cars	Jewelry of precious metal
T-shirts, knit	Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit	T-shirts, knit	Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	Parts of motor vehicles
Women's suits and pants	Monitors and projectors	Motor vehicles for transporting goods	T-shirts, knit	Parts of motor vehicles	Motor vehicles for transporting goods
Other nuts	Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	Parts of motor vehicles	Jewelry of precious metal	Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged
Women's suits, knit	Cars	Women's suits and pants	Semifinished products of iron or nonalloy steel	Other bars of iron, not further worked than forged	Women's suits and pants
Semifinished products of iron or nonalloy steel	Men's suits and pants	Parts of motor vehicles	Insulated electrical wire	T-shirts, knit	Insulated electrical wire
Leather apparel	House linen	Men's suits and pants	Women's suits and pants	Insulated electrical wire	T-shirts, knit
Women's undergarments, knit	Other aircraft and spacecraft	Other nuts	Gold	Women's suits and pants	Refrigerators, freezers
Men's suits and pants	Parts of motor vehicles	Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit	Monitors and projectors	Other nuts	Sweaters, pullovers, sweatshirts etc., knit

0.41

0.47

0.71

0.33

ECI: Economic Complexity Index

Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse.

ECI:

Economic

Complexity

Index

0.23

0.30

### Product space allows to show product concentration and complexity



The coordinates represent UMAP embeddings of a proximity matrix, where distances between products are meaningful and represent their relatedness based on whether products are co-exported by countries. Products have also been clustered into knowledge clusters based on co-export patterns. Note that the node positions in the node data consider the entire proximity matrix, while the edge data only shows the top relatedness links for visualization purposes. The layout has been optimized for visualization, with uninformative links removed. More info here "The Atlas of Economic Complexity," Center for International Development at Harvard University





based on whether products are co-exported by countries.



# 04

# Opportunities for Mexico & Türkiye

Relationship between IHH and Complexity reveals that diversification is correlated with higher economic complexity





Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse. Note: Node size proportional to export value. The coordinates represent embeddings of a proximity matrix, where distances between products are meaningful and represent their relatedness based on whether products are co-exported by countries.



Metalworking and Electrical Machinery

Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse. Note: Node size proportional to export value. The coordinates represent embeddings of a proximity matrix, where distances between products are meaningful and represent their relatedness

based on whether products are co-exported by countries.

### Higher export concentration is associated to lower economic complexity



- This relationship appears more substantial in the "destination" dimension of export concentration, especially for Türkiye.
- In the case of product concentration, the relationship is loose but negative for Türkiye; in the case of Mexico, the slope changes.

### Most competitive industries (RCA) match higher product complexity

#### **MEXICO REVEALED COMPARATIVE ADVANTAGE, 2020** (INDUSTRIES WITH VALUE ADDED ADJUSTED RCA > 1)\*

#### Construction 4.6 Transportation Eq. 4.9 Textile Mills 4.1 Non Metallic Products 2.7 Transportation services 2.4 Air transport 27 Wholesale, Retail Tourism 1.6 2.4 Repair Fishing 2.1 Agriculture 1.6 Fabricated Metal Products 1.9 Primary Metal 1.9 Primary Metal 1.4 Agriculture Electrical Eq. 1.3 Transportation services 1.6 Components Plastics, Rubber Products 1.6 Tourism 1.2 Warehousing, transp. sup. 1.5 Transportation Eq. .4 Mining (energy) 1.2 Electrical Eq., Components 1.4 Mining (non energy) 1.1 Other Services 1.4 Paper, Printing 1.3 Computer, Electronics 1.0 Other Manufacturing 1.3 1.3 1.0 Goverment Non Metallic Products Water transport 1.3 Fabricated Metal 0.9 Wholesale, Retail, Repair 1.2 Products Food Manufacturing 1.2 Food Manufacturing 0.9 **Real Estate** 1.1 2.0 3.0 0.0 1.0 4.0 5.0 1.0 2.0 3.0 4.0 5.0 0.0

Source: BBVA Research with data from OECD.

\*Following the methodology proposed by Koopman et al. (2014) we adjust this index to subtract the foreign content from the value of exports to measure competitiveness in terms of domestic added value.

#### TÜRKIYE: REVEALED COMPARATIVE ADVANTAGE, 2020 (INDUSTRIES WITH VALUE ADDED ADJUSTED RCA > 1)\*



05

## Policy Analysis: Tax incentives

Fiscal incentives should be directed towards the most competitive industries enabling more complex products

**Creating Opportunities** 

#### Mexico: Tax incentives aim at 6 RCA industries with high complexity products

SHECP Steptendo Statuco Statuc In October 2023, the Mexican government released an Act granting tax incentives to key sectors, as long as they produce, prepare or manufacture the following goods and also export them. The tax incentives include deductions ranging from 56% to 89% in fixed assets across 10 key sectors.



### Mexico's tax incentive programs focus on Chemicals and Machinery





Still, it is too early to assess the effectiveness of the tax incentive program due to a lack of data on the number of firms that have applied or the amount that has been subsidized to them.

Source: BBVA Research with data from Harvard Dataverse.

### Plan México expands previous fiscal incentives to all industries

Last week of december 2024, the National Strategy for Industrialization and Shared Prosperity was unveiled, summarized as *Plan México*.



The first comprehensive project from Mexico's federal government focused on strengthening the country's role in global value chains (GVC) through incentives for private investment, infrastructure development (energy, water, and transportation), and human capital training, all in coordination with government departments and agencies. The initial document of the Mexico Plan presents 11 ambitious goals for 2030.

#### Goals in Pan México towards 2030 regarding GVC and FDI

- Nearshoring statue: Deduction of new investments in incremental fixed assets aimed at high-tech, research, and development investments. Additional 25% of worker's training expenses.
  - Foreign and Mexican companies may apply without discrimination across industries or sectors.
- +15% domestic content in GVC by in key industries such as automotive, aerospace, electronics, semiconductors, pharmaceuticals, and chemicals
- + 1.5 million jobs in specialized manufacturing and strategic sectors
- IMMEX 4.0: consolidates the VAT and IEPS (Excise Tax) certification process

### Türkiye: Understanding the tax and investment supports & incentives

The Ministry of Industry and Technology provides investment support to firms in various forms of tax, employment, financial and other types of incentives.



The ministry provides information on type of incentives foreseen to be allocated to firms on monthly terms between 2019-2023 period. We analyzed this data and manually matched <u>US97</u> sector codes (product classification created by the Turkish Ministry of Industry and Technology, non related to any US current classification) with HS 97 2 and 4 digit codes for the available period to gauge to the distribution of incentives on the product space.



#### Türkiye: Shifting trend in policy incentives with focus on more complex products



#### Türkiye: Shifting trend in policy incentives with focus on more complex products



# Manufacturing industry constitutes 64% of the support incentives, while the focus on regions have been increasing over time

The objective of the incentive program by the Ministry of Science, Industry and Technology could be summarized as:

- Increased production of intermediate goods and products with high import dependency in Turkey.
- Increase in medium and high tech investments
- Reducing regional development disparities and providing development opportunities in the least developed regions.

#### THE DISTRIBUTION OF UNIQUE FIRMS WITH INVESTMENT INCENTIVE BY SECTORS (2023)



Manufacturing Energy Services Agriculture Mining

### DISTRIBUTION OF UNIQUE FIRMS WITH AN INVESTMENT INCENTIVE (%)



#### **Priority areas for policy incentives**

Priority Investments are considered as Region 5 Investments, meaning that following incentives are provided to these sectors:

- VAT Exemption
- Custom Duty Exemption
- Tax Deduction up to 50%
- Social Security Premium in longer horizons
- Land Allocation and Interest/Profit Share Support



### **Priority areas according to HIT30 programme**

- HIT30 Policy Framework definition: The Ministry of Industry and Technology recently announced a new investment • programme providing support and incentives to specialized projects in high-priority technology areas.
- Projects to be supported under HIT-30 programME are expected to have concentrated focus on emerging technologies, ensuring competitiveness through economies of scale, requiring technical competence and financial capabilities, bringing further know-how and expertise along with intellectual property rights.
- The program is envisaged to allocate \$30 billion worth of support for high-tech investments by 2030, with the major part of support going to electrical vehicles and semiconductor chip technologies.



Semiconductors



Mobility



Green Energy



Healthy Living



Advanced Manufacturing



**Digital Technologies** 



Communication and Space



Investments to Complement the Value Chain

#### TECHNOLOGY RELATED SUPPORT **BUDGET UNDER HIT30 PROGRAM** (bn \$)



#### **Türkiye's incentive policies : A critique**



Türkiye's investment incentives are primarily composed of tax incentives, including tax reduction, VAT exemption, custom duty exemption and VAT refunds. This yields costs to the fiscal budget, hence incentivizing through fiscal policy may not be sustainable. Efficiency of tax incentives are dependent on the investment climate of the country. If a convenient investment climate is not maintained (at least for a particular project by means of specific guarantees to protect the investment), tax incentives often result in little or no new investment. More targeted and project-based tax incentives that are subject to evaluation could be more beneficial. Screening and monitoring before and after incentives are crucial in order to reduce free-riding, misreporting, lobbying and deadweight loss. In this respect, the Ministry's HIT30 programme could be regarded as a good example with its more targeted approach but there needs to be higher transparency in the evaluation and monitoring of the projects.



Depending on the business environment, protecting the tax base and providing facilities to firms helping the reduction of firms' cost may result in higher efficiency. In the long run, tax policy and administration could aim reforms achieving tax rates at more reasonable levels and less complex, more transparent and all-encompassing tax administration. In the case that this goal is achieved, investment incentives could be developed in different forms other than tax incentives.

### Türkiye's incentive policies : A critique

Some industries are considered under the category of priority investments to further incentivize the high-tech value added sectors. Yet, the medium term structural deficiencies in terms of the level of preparedness for emerging high technology sectors may demand further structural adjustments. In terms of the level of preparedness for AI technologies, Türkiye performs much better than Emerging Economies, especially in the area of digital infrastructure, pointing to a relatively more comfortable space for AI technologies to flourish. However, human capital is also an important factor explaining the use of AI technologies in the workplace: 78.9% of the enterprises surveyed by the Turkstat in 2023, stated the lack of relevant expertise in the enterprise among the reasons not using AI technologies.

The skill gap is also apparent in the use of new technologies: According to Survey of Adult Skills, 38% of the adult population (16-65 year-olds) report no prior experience with computers and only 7.8% of the adult population score at the highest levels in problem solving in technology-rich environments. The investment incentives on these sectors should be supported with transformative and reforming policies addressing the skill gap in technology.

#### Al Preparedness Index, level, 2023



### Tax incentives programs should aim to potential gains in complexity



### **Conclusions and future work**

01	Higher export concentration is associated to lower economic complexity in both countries*	<ul> <li>Diversifying the export destinations is correlated with higher economic complexity, this relation is stronger for Türkiye</li> <li>Mexico could take advantage of this trend to diversify the export partners looking into Europe/Asia</li> </ul>
02	Turkey's complexity increased by 28.1% between 2011-2022, while Mexico has remained stagnant	<ul> <li>Türkiye's top traded products' complexity has increased steadily, from Textiles to Machinery with potential gains**.</li> <li>Mexico is already focused on exporting highly complex products, explaining the stagnation. Still, the country shows potential in Electronic and Electrical goods**</li> </ul>
03	Fiscal incentives should be directed towards the most competitive industries (RCA) enabling more complex products (PCI)	<ul> <li>Türkiye's tax benefits, while more diverse, are aimed at industries with lower complexity potential gain.</li> <li>Mexico's nearshoring incentive program (launched in 2023) aim at 6 RCA industries.</li> </ul>

\* The slope for Mexico reverses in the product dimension, meaning the country might be diversifying into less complex products. \*\* Shown by the <u>product space proximity</u> of several under-exported products of this industry

Follow-up idea: Use the <u>V-Dem Dataset</u>, trade and FDI flows to create a "Political trade index", based on weighted sum of the political affinity of each trade/FDI partner; we can then relate this index to the economic complexity dynamics.
 E.g. Does trading with a politically aligned country lead to greater complexity in the medium to long run?



# **Türkiye and Mexico:** Export concentration & Economic Complexity

March 2025

**Creating Opportunities** 

#### References

- Belotti, F., Borin, A., and Mancini, M. 2021. *"icio Economic Analysis with InterCountry Input-Output tables"*, The Stata Journal, 2021 (21) 3.
- Borin, A., and Mancini, M. 2019. "Measuring What Matters in Global Value Chains and Value-Added Trade ", Policy Research working paper. no. WPS 8804. Washington, D.C. : World Bank Group.
- **De Backer, K. and S. Miroudot** (2013), *"Mapping Global Value Chains"*, OECD Trade Policy Papers, No. 159, OECD Publishing, Paris.
- Hausmann, R., Hidalgo, C. A., Bustos, S., Coscia, M., Simoes, A., & Yıldırım, M. (2013). "The Atlas of Economic Complexity: Mapping Paths to Prosperity" Harvard University Press
- Hidalgo, C. A., Klinger, B., Barabasi, A.-L., & Hausmann, R. (2007). "The Product Space Conditions the Development of Nations". Science, 317(5837)
- Koopman, Wang & Wei (2014). "*Tracing Value-Added and Double Counting in Gross Exports*," American Economic Review, American Economic Association, vol. 104(2), pages 459-494, February

### This report has been produced by:

Gül Yücel Senior Economist BBVA Research Türkiye gulyu@bbva.com

Diego López Senior Economist BBVA Research México diegoalberto.lopez@bbva.com

ENQUIRIES TO: BBVA Research: Paseo de la Reforma 510, Colonia Juárez, C.P. 06600 Mexico City, Mexico. Tel.: +52 55 5621 3434 - www.bbvaresearch.com

### **Disclaimer**

The present document does not constitute an "Investment Recommendation", as defined in Regulation (EU) No 596/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 16 April 2014 on market abuse ("MAR"). In particular, this document does not constitute "Investment Research" nor "Marketing Material", for the purposes of article 36 of the Regulation (EU) 2017/565 of 25 April 2016 supplementing Directive 2014/65/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards organisational requirements and operating conditions for investment firms and defined terms for the purposes of that Directive (MIFID II).

Readers should be aware that under no circumstances should they base their investment decisions on the information contained in this document. Those persons or entities offering investment products to these potential investors are legally required to provide the information needed for them to take an appropriate investment decision.

This document has been prepared by BBVA Research Department. It is provided for information purposes only and expresses data or opinions regarding the date of issue of the report, prepared by BBVA or obtained from or based on sources we consider to be reliable, and have not been independently verified by BBVA. Therefore, BBVA offers no warranty, either express or implicit, regarding its accuracy, integrity or correctness.

This document and its contents are subject to changes without prior notice depending on variables such as the economic context or market fluctuations. BBVA is not responsible for updating these contents or for giving notice of such changes.

BBVA accepts no liability for any loss, direct or indirect, that may result from the use of this document or its contents.

This document and its contents do not constitute an offer, invitation or solicitation to purchase, divest or enter into any interest in financial assets or instruments. Neither shall this document nor its contents form the basis of any contract, commitment or decision of any kind.

The content of this document is protected by intellectual property laws. Reproduction, transformation, distribution, public communication, making available, extraction, reuse, forwarding or use of any nature by any means or process is prohibited, except in cases where it is legally permitted or expressly authorised by BBVA on its website www.bbvaresearch.com.